

Special Topics Lecture:

**Why empty KB is TRUE and
empty Clause is FALSE**

by Rick Lathrop

Notation used in this Special Topics lecture

- Prefix notation (or extended Polish notation)
 - The operator appears first, followed by its arguments
 - (AND A B C) in **prefix** notation is (A AND B AND C) in **infix** notation
 - (OR A B C) in **prefix** notation is (A OR B OR C) in **infix** notation
 - Prefix notation enables an easy parser — it looks at the first element of each list and dispatches args to a handler for that operator token.
 - Lisp and related languages define their entire syntax in prefix notation
 - See https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Polish_notation
 - Prefix allows any arity, delimited by (...); strict Polish = fixed arity
- Conjunctive Normal Form (CNF) — the AND of ORs
 - $KB = \{ \text{AND (OR literal-1 literal-2 ...) (OR literal-3 literal-4 ...) ...} \}$
- Drop ANDs and ORs — we know where they are (clausal notation)
 - $KB = \{ (\text{literal-1 literal-2 ...}) (\text{literal-3 literal-4 ...}) ... \}$
 - In this lecture, KB uses {...} brackets, clauses use (...) parentheses
 - Here, the empty KB {} always means {AND} with no clauses
 - Here, the empty clause () always means (OR) with no literals

Side Trip: Functions AND, OR, and identity values

function AND(*arglist*) **returns** a truth-value
 return ANDOR(*arglist*, TRUE)

/ Think of AND as by default TRUE, but args may make it FALSE */*

function OR(*arglist*) **returns** a truth-value
 return ANDOR(*arglist*, FALSE)

/ Think of OR as by default FALSE, but args may make it TRUE */*

function ANDOR(*arglist*, *identityvalue*) **returns** a truth-value

/ identityvalue is TRUE for AND, and is FALSE for OR. */*

if (*arglist* == NIL)

then return *identityvalue*

if (FIRST(*arglist*) == NOT(*identityvalue*))

then return NOT(*identityvalue*)

return ANDOR(REST(*arglist*), *identityvalue*)

So: AND() evaluates to TRUE and OR() evaluates to FALSE!

**Side Trip: We only need one logical connective.
(Note: AND, OR, NOT are “syntactic sugar” in logic.)**

Both NAND and NOR are logically complete.

- **NAND is also called the “Sheffer stroke”**
- **NOR is also called “Pierce’s arrow”**

$$(\text{NOT } A) = (\text{NAND } A \text{ TRUE}) = (\text{NOR } A \text{ FALSE})$$

$$\begin{aligned}(\text{AND } A \text{ B}) &= (\text{NAND TRUE (NAND } A \text{ B)}) \\ &= (\text{NOR (NOR } A \text{ FALSE) (NOR } B \text{ FALSE)})\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}(\text{OR } A \text{ B}) &= (\text{NAND (NAND } A \text{ TRUE) (NAND } B \text{ TRUE)}) \\ &= (\text{NOR FALSE (NOR } A \text{ B)})\end{aligned}$$

This fact is exploited by, e.g., VLSI semiconductor fabrication, which often provide a single NAND/NOR gate for efficiency.

Review: $KB \models S$ means $\models (KB \Rightarrow S)$

- $KB \models S$ is read "KB entails S."
 - Means "S is true in every world (model) in which KB is true."
- $KB \models S$ is equivalent to $\models (KB \Rightarrow S)$
 - $\models (KB \Rightarrow S)$ means "(KB \Rightarrow S) is true in every world (i.e., is valid)."
 - $\models (KB \Rightarrow S)$ means $\text{TRUE} \models (KB \Rightarrow S)$ means $\{\} \models (KB \Rightarrow S)$
- And so: $\{\} \models S$ is equivalent to $\models (\{\} \Rightarrow S)$
- So what does $(\{\} \Rightarrow S)$ mean?
 - Means "TRUE implies S."
 - Means "S is valid."
 - In Horn form, means "S is a fact." p. 256 (3rd ed.; p. 281, 2nd ed.)
- **Why does $\{\}$ mean TRUE here,
but $()$ means FALSE in resolution proofs?**

Review: (TRUE \Rightarrow S) means “S is a fact.”

- By convention,
 - The null conjunct is “syntactic sugar” for TRUE (see above slides).
 - The null disjunct is “syntactic sugar” for FALSE (see following slides).
 - **Each is assigned the truth value of its identity element.**
 - For conjuncts, TRUE is the identity: $(A \wedge \text{TRUE}) \equiv A$
 - For disjuncts, FALSE is the identity: $(A \vee \text{FALSE}) \equiv A$
- A KB is the conjunction of all of its sentences.
 - So we see that $\{\}$ is the null conjunct and means TRUE.
 - Better way to think of it: $\{\}$ does not **exclude** any worlds (models) because nothing **falsifies** the dominant connective **AND**.
- In Conjunctive Normal Form each clause is a disjunct.
 - So we see that $()$ is the null disjunct and means FALSE.
 - Better way to think of it: \emptyset does not **include** any worlds (models) because nothing **satisfies** the dominant connective **OR**.